

**MINUTES OF THE GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE ON FRIDAY 13  
SEPTEMBER 2019**

**PRESENT**

**Member**

Councillor Derek Bullock  
Councillor Roy Walker  
Councillor Angeliki Stogia  
Councillor Naeem Hassan  
Councillor John Leech  
Councillor Dzidra Noor  
Councillor Ateeque Ur-Rehman  
Councillor Howard Sykes  
Councillor Sean Fielding  
Councillor Phil Burke  
Councillor Shah Wazir  
Councillor Roger Jones  
Councillor Barry Warner  
Councillor Matt Wynne  
Councillor Angela Clark  
Councillor Warren Bray  
Councillor Peter Robinson  
Councillor Doreen Dickinson  
Councillor Nathan Evans  
Councillor Mark Aldred (Chair)  
Councillor Joanne Marshall

**Representing**

Bolton  
Bury  
Manchester  
Manchester  
Manchester  
Manchester  
Oldham  
Oldham  
Oldham  
Rochdale  
Rochdale  
Salford  
Salford  
Stockport  
Stockport  
Tameside  
Tameside  
Tameside  
Trafford  
Wigan  
Wigan

**Officers in attendance**

|                  |                                 |
|------------------|---------------------------------|
| Bob Morris       | Chief Operating Officer         |
| Kate Brown       | Director of Corporate Affairs   |
| Alison Chew      | Interim Head of Bus Services    |
| Alex Cropper     | Head of Operations              |
| Danny Vaughan    | Head of Metrolink               |
| Caroline Whittam | Head of Rail Franchising        |
| Gwynne Williams  | Deputy Monitoring Officer, GMCA |
| Sylvia Welsh     | Governance and Scrutiny         |
| Jamie Fallon     | Governance and Scrutiny         |

**Operators in attendance**

|               |              |
|---------------|--------------|
| David Golding | Network Rail |
|---------------|--------------|

Christopher Jackson  
Raj Chandarana  
Kathryn O'Brien  
Nigel Featham

Northern Railway  
Northern Railway  
First Group  
Go Northwest

### **GMTC/29/19 APOLOGIES**

#### **RESOLVED /-**

That apologies were received and noted from Councillors Beth Mortenson, David Meller, Liam O'Rourke, Steve Adshead, and Stuart Haslam.

### **GMTC/30/19 CHAIRS ANNOUNCEMENTS AND URGENT BUSINESS**

#### **RESOLVED /-**

There were no chairs announcements or urgent business.

### **GMTC/31/19 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

#### **RESOLVED /-**

Councillor Phil Burke declared a personal interest in relation to Item 6 (Transport Network Performance), and Item 7 (Free Bus – Forthcoming Changes and Performance Update) as an employee of Metrolink.

### **GMTC/32/19 MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD 9 AUGUST 2019**

The minutes of the meeting held on the 9 August 2019 were submitted for consideration. Councillor Sykes confirmed that he was in attendance at this meeting, and requested that this be reflected within the minutes.

Councillor Evans confirmed that Officers had met with himself and Councillor Adshead to discuss the alternative options available to passengers who had previously used the 245 service. Following the meeting, a case study had been submitted for consideration, but no further feedback had been received.

Officers were informed that residents were compiling a petition regarding the withdrawal of the 389 service, which services Hyde and Duckinfield.

Members highlighted that they had not yet received the finalised Rail Prospectus, and a note detailing the transport support arrangements for Party Conferences, including plans for fringe receptions. Members requested that this information be circulated as soon as possible.

## **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the minutes of the GM Transport Committee held on 9 August be approved as a correct record, subject to the addition of Councillor Sykes to the attendance.
2. That it be noted that Officers had met with Councillor Evans and Adshead to discuss the alternative options available to passengers who had previously used the 245 service and were awaiting a final response regarding the case study submitted.
3. That it be noted that TfGM would be in receipt of a petition regarding the withdrawal of the 389 service servicing Hyde and Duckinfield.
4. That it be noted that Officers would circulate the Rail Prospectus, and a note detailing the transport support arrangements for Party Conferences including plans for fringe receptions as soon as possible.

## **GMTC/33/19 GREATER MANCHESTER TRANSPORT COMMITTEE WORK PROGRAMME**

Gwynne Williams, Deputy Monitoring Officer, GMCA, took members through the work programme for the GM Transport Committee, confirming that it reflected the reports previously requested by the Committee.

Members felt that there was a need to focus more on policy development opportunities, and requested the following items be included within the work programme:

### October 2019

- High Speed 2 and 3
- Tram/Train Development
- Tram Technology Update (electric and hydrogen)

### November / December 2019

- Rail Investment Bids – Pipeline Overview
- Update on the future of Piccadilly Platforms 15 and 16
- Brexit (the predicted impacts on Transport and Investment)
- Climate Emergency (how can emission reduction be accelerated in transport)
- GM Clean Air Update (electric vehicles, charging points, taxi's, small businesses)
- GM Minimum Standards for Taxi and Private Hire Update
- Made to Move Update

Concerns were raised, regarding the number of items contained within the work programme, which had not yet been assigned a meeting date, contact officer, or key function, given that there were only six meetings remaining within this municipal year.

Members considered the implications of the climate emergency, which the GMCA had declared at its July 2019 meeting, and explored how the Committee could support the acceleration of the reduction of emissions in transport. Members were reminded that the 10 local authorities of GM were working collaboratively to develop a GM Clean Air Plan, notwithstanding that, the Committee could formerly submit their views to the GMCA for consideration.

Councillor Jones expressed his thanks to TfGM and the GM Chamber of Commerce for hosting the Clean Air Roadshow, at AJ Bell Stadium, on 10 September 2019, which was well received by businesses. It was suggested that Officers explore further opportunities to host events across GM to encourage businesses to participate across GM.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the draft work Programme from September 2019 to January 2020 be noted, with the addition of the following items:

##### October 2019

- High Speed 2 and 3
- Tram/Train Development
- Tram Technology Update (electric and hydrogen)

##### November / December 2019

- Rail Investment Bids – Pipeline Overview
  - Update on the future of Piccadilly Platforms 15 and 16
  - Brexit (the predicted impacts on Transport and Investment)
  - Climate Emergency (how can emission reduction be accelerated in transport)
  - GM Clean Air Update (electric vehicles, charging points, taxi's, small businesses)
  - GM Minimum Standards for Taxi and Private Hire Update
  - Made to Move Update
2. That Officers be requested to include specific details relating to the reports to be scheduled (Meeting date, contact officer, alignment to which key function of the Committee)
  3. That it be noted that the 10 local authorities of GM were working collaboratively with the GMCA on the GM Clean Air Plan.
  4. That the Committee record its thanks to Officers for hosting the Clean Air Roadshow, at AJ Bell Stadium, on 10 September 2019, and that Officers be requested to explore opportunities to host further events across Greater Manchester.

## **GMTC/34/19 TRANSPORT NETWORK PERFORMANCE – JULY 2019**

Alex Cropper, Head of Operations, TfGM, provided an overview of Transport Network Performance in Greater Manchester for July 2019.

The following key points were raised:

- Metrolink performance was not as strong in July 2019, with performance improved during early August 2019, noting that this would be reflected in next month's report.
- Metrolink services had recently been disrupted as a consequence of a fatality on the network, at the Burton Road stop, impacting on reliability. Members were reminded of the impact of such instances on staff, with many receiving counselling. In order to address this growing trend, Officers were exploring opportunities to raise awareness of the issue.
- Contactless payments had now been launched on Metrolink services (on 15th July 2019). Since its launch, approximately 100,000 users had taken journeys using contactless.
- Rail performance continued to be of concern with continued dialogue with train operators regarding the roll out of new rolling stock.
- Bus performance had maintained a good level of performance, with performance above the targets for scheduled service reliability and overall punctuality. It was noted that Go-Ahead were continuing to add value to the bus network in Greater Manchester.
- Members were informed that TfGM had been independently nominated for a National Transport Award.

Members raised concerns regarding the performance of a number of bus services, (including the 471, 163, 98) which were now being operated by Diamond North West. Officers confirmed that they were monitoring the situation, adding that the operator was actively recruiting bus drivers. Officers offered to meet with those Members who wished to raise specific operational issues.

Councillor Fielding reported that a number of his constituents had been incorrectly charged for their Metrolink journeys, following the introduction of contactless payments. It was confirmed that the launch of contactless payments had been an extraordinary success. There were still some teething issues to be addressed, with enhanced communication messages had been implemented, including on stop support and driver announcements to remind passengers. The Committee were informed that Metrolink Passengers who had been incorrectly charged using contactless payments, could request a refund via TfGM.

Further information was requested in relation the breakdown of reliability issues by Metrolink line, so that Members could seek to address these locally. It was agreed that this analysis would be incorporated in to future Metrolink Performance reports (next update in October).

**RESOLVED /-**

1. That the report be noted.
2. That it be noted that dialogue with train operators regarding performance and the roll out of new rolling stock continued.
3. That it be noted that Metrolink services had recently been disrupted as a consequence of a fatality on the network, at the Burton Road stop, resulting in an impact on reliability. This incident has had a severe impact on staff and Officers were exploring opportunities to raise awareness of the growing issue.
4. That it be noted that TfGM were monitoring the issues affecting contactless payments on Metrolink (double tapping and incomplete journeys), and enhanced communication messages (including on stop support and driver announcements) have been implemented to remind passengers.
5. That it be noted that Metrolink Passengers who have been incorrectly charged using contactless payments can request a refund via TfGM.
6. That it be noted that a breakdown of reliability issues by Metrolink line be incorporated in to future Metrolink Performance reports (next update in October).
7. That it be noted that there had been a number of issues relating to performance, following the operation of a number of bus services by Diamond North West, including capacity, with officers offering to meet with those Members who wished to raise specific operational issues.
8. That it be noted that Diamond North West are actively recruiting drivers to address capacity issues.
9. That it be noted that TfGM had been independently nominated for a National Transport Award.

## **GMTC/35/19 FREE BUS – FORTHCOMING CHANGES AND PERFORMANCE REPORT – KEY DECISION**

Alison Chew, Interim Head of Bus Services, TfGM, introduced a report which informed Members of the proposed changes to the Manchester Free Bus service and also provided an update on performance.

The following key points were highlighted:

- Following a retendering exercise last October, First had been awarded the contract to operate the free bus service, which replaced the previous Manchester Metroshuttle service.
- Free Bus has been operated by Go North West since June 2019, following the sale of the Queens Road bus depot and operations from First to the Go Ahead Group.
- The proposed changes to the Free Bus service have been derived following a review of performance during its first year of operation, including ongoing operational issues and recurring themes in customer and operator feedback. TfGM officers have worked with the operator to find a cost-neutral but effective way of improving the service for customers.

Councillor Leach requested further information regarding the rationale for the removal of daytime free bus services servicing Deansgate and Oxford Road. It was confirmed that the proposals had been developed following a review of patronage and alternative transport links, and customer feedback. Feedback from users indicated that the night-time economy (services which run between 7pm and 12pm) were more likely to use these stations. It was agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Leach to discuss the rationale for the removal of daytime Deansgate and Oxford Road stations free bus services.

Councillor Wynne highlighted that he had not received an update from Officers regarding the Stagecoach proposal, which was developed following the withdrawal of the Stockport Metro in April 19. It was agreed that Officers would provide an update to Councillor Wynne.

Councillor Burke raised concerns regarding the substantial increase in the prices of children's tickets implemented by Rosso. It was agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Burke to these concerns.

### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the performance of the service noted.
2. That the proposed changes to the Manchester Free Bus Service be approved.

3. That it be agreed that Officers would provide an update to Councillor Wynne regarding the Stagecoach proposal, which was developed following the withdrawal of the Stockport Metro in April 19.
4. That it be agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Leach to discuss the rationale for the removal of daytime Deansgate and Oxford Road stations free bus services.
5. That it be noted that evening services run between 7pm and 12pm.
6. That it be agreed that Officers would meet with Councillor Burke to discuss the increase in the price of children's tickets implemented by Rosso.

### **GMTC/36/19 RAIL ANNUAL PERFORMANCE**

Bob Morris, Chief Operating Officer, TfGM, introduced a report which provided Members with an annual overview of rail performance in Greater Manchester from Rail Period 5, 2018/19 to Period 4 2019/20 (22 July 2018 – 20 July 2019).

A Member referred to the Transport for the North rail survey results, which indicated that when compared to last year, users felt that rail service performance had continued to decline. Northern confirmed that they judge their performance against the results of the National Rail Passenger Survey (NRPS), which had demonstrated a 17% increase in customer satisfaction since May 2018. The results indicated that punctuality was the biggest driver of satisfaction, followed by how delays are handled, and cleanliness.

It was felt that this level of increase was minimal when compared to the performance levels, following the introduction of the May 2018 timetable. Northern recognised that there was more to do, and confirmed that they were working extremely hard to rebuild trust and increase patronage, with the launch of campaigns such as the '£1m giveaway', and the 'flash sale.' Transpennine Express reported that in order to address many of the issues such as overcrowding, investment in the North was required.

Councillor Burke raised concerns regarding the short notice cancellations, and non stopping trains, with no advance notice, which was affecting Rochdale stations (Smithy Hill, Castleton and Mills Hill). Northern confirmed that this was primarily due to driver shortages and the priority given to London train services. Members assured that work continued to develop proposals for one set of terms and conditions train drivers which would replace the current three different sets terms and conditions. Sunday working for high number of train drivers was voluntary, and often led to a shortage and consequently the need for short notice cancellations of many services, particularly in the North West. It was noted that Northern were continuing their dialogue with Storm and Aslef, with a view to retabling the proposals later in the year. Northern agreed to meet with Councillor Burke to discuss how the issues can be handled more appropriately.

Councillor Clark welcomed the platform extension at Brinnington Station, and requested further information regarding the Hathersage and Hope platform extensions, which would be able to accommodate longer trains with more seats. Northern agreed to provide further information on the progress of developments.

Councillor Noor raised concerns regarding the appearance of Levenshulme Station, and queried whether any improvements were planned. Northern advised that they had invested approximately £50million into improving the customers experience at stations, noting that Levenshulme, was included in a future work programme. Further work would be undertaken to look at improvements in the short term.

It was noted that Northern had also allocated £250,000 in funding to Community Groups who had helped to improve the aesthetics of stations such as Hope Valley and Heaton Chapel.

Members sought clarification on the timetable for the removal of Pacers Units from operation in GM. Northern confirmed that all Pacers Units would be removed in Greater Manchester by the end of the year. Currently 19 new trains were in operation on routes across the North West, with a view to widening across the network throughout the remainder of the year.

It was agreed that Northern would invite Members to the new train launch events, which would be announced over the next few months.

It was felt that although the report indicated that there had been improvements in the number of short formed trains, this paired with overcrowding on trains, continued to be a significant issue. Members requested that an analysis be incorporated into future rail performance reports. Officers confirmed that dialogue with train operators was continuing in order to address the issues affecting performance.

Councillor Wynne raised concerns regarding the number of penalty fares issued by Northern since 2017, and requested that future performance reports include this analysis. Following discussion, it was agreed that Northern would meet with Councillor Wynne to discuss the number of penalty fares issued since 2017.

**RESOLVED /-**

1. That the report be noted.
2. That the Committee's concerns regarding ongoing rail performance issues be noted.
3. That it be noted that Northern were continuing their dialogue with Storm and Aslef regarding a new terms and conditions for drivers, with a view to retabling the proposals later in the year.

4. That it be noted that Northern would meet with Councillor Burke regarding the short notice cancellations affecting Rochdale stations (Smithy Hill, Castleton and Mills Hill).
5. That it be noted that dialogue with train operators regarding overcrowding, and in particular around 'stop skipping' and 'short forming' continues.
6. That an analysis of 'short forming' be incorporated in to future Rail Performance reports.
7. That an analysis of 'penalty fares' issued since 2017 be incorporated into the next Rail Performance report.
8. That it be agreed that Northern would meet with Councillor Wynne to discuss the number of penalty fares issued since 2017, given the ongoing performance issues to be addressed.
9. That it be agreed that Northern would provide further information to Members regarding the Hathersage and Hope platform extensions.
10. That it be noted that improvements to the appearance of Levenshulme Station were including in a future programme of work, with a view to exploring improvement options.
11. That it be noted that Northern would invite Members to the new train launch events.

#### **GMTC/37/19 CENTRE FOR LOCAL ECONOMIC STRATEGY**

Kate Brown, Director of Corporate Affairs, TfGM, presented a report which provided an overview of the Centre for Local Economic Strategies (CLES).

Councillor Jones commended the excellent work conducted by CLES for GM local authorities, and explored whether Members could be provided with an overview of the transport related work they had conducted for GM, in order to raise awareness of the wealth of support they provide. Officers confirmed that they would contact CLES to explore whether this request could be met.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the key policy areas and previous commission for TfGM be noted.
2. That the Committee record its thanks to CLES for the support it has provided to Greater Manchester regarding the development of economic and social research and policy with a focus on people and place.

3. That it be agreed that Officers would contact CLES to request that they provide an overview of the transport related work they have conducted for GM local authorities which can be shared for Members to raise awareness.

### **GMTC/38/19 RAIL STATIONS ACCESS FOR ALL MID TIER PROGRAMME**

Bob Morris, Chief Operating Officer, TfGM, introduced a report, which provided an update on the proposed Greater Manchester submission to the Access for All Mid-Tier Programme in October 2019.

The following key points were highlighted:

- In July 2019, DfT announced the Access for All Mid-Tier programme. The fund would provide £20 million nationally, focused on stations where accessibility improvements could be delivered, with a fixed contribution per nomination of up to £1 million of government support.
- The fund was targeted at smaller scale access improvements.
- It is proposed that a single nomination covering a number of smaller improvements at 22 stations would be submitted.
- An update report would be presented at the meeting on the 11th October 2019 prior to the submission of the Access for All mid-tier submission on the 18th October 2019.

Councillor Leach enquired whether the 22 stations were listed in priority order, and explored what action would be taken, should the bid only be partially successful. It was confirmed that the list was in geographical order, noting that should the bid only be partially successful, the process of prioritising projects would be unique, based upon deliverability and value for money. It was acknowledged that previous bid submissions which had been listed in priority order, had not been awarded in this way.

Councillor Fielding raised concerns regarding the accessibility issues at Greenfield Station, noting that the interim solution, paying for taxis to Stalybridge was not sustainable. It was confirmed that Officers had raised the issue at the Transport for North Board, and were continuing to explore the potential funding options.

### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the report be noted.
2. That it be noted that an update report will be presented to the GMTC on the 11 October 2019, prior to submission of the Access for All mid-tier submission on the 18 October 2019.

3. That it be noted that Officers were continuing to explore the potential funding options, in order to address the accessibility issues at Greenfield Station, including raising the issue at the Transport for North Board.