

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE  
GMCA OVERVIEW & SCRUTINY COMMITTEE  
HELD WEDNESDAY 16 AUGUST 2023  
AT THE TOOTAL BUILDINGS, BROADHURST HOUSE, 1ST FLOOR,  
56 OXFORD STREET, MANCHESTER, M1 6EU**

**PRESENT:**

Councillor Nadim Muslim	Bolton Council (Chair)
Councillor Peter Wright	Bolton Council
Councillor Russell Bernstein	Bury Council
Councillor Nathan Boroda	Bury Council
Councillor Mary Whitby	Bury Council
Councillor Linda Foley	Manchester City Council
Councillor Mandie Shilton Godwin	Manchester City Council
Councillor John Leech	Manchester City Council
Councillor Tom Besford	Rochdale Council
Councillor Patricia Dale	Rochdale Council
Councillor Sameena Zaheer	Rochdale Council
Councillor Joshua Brooks	Salford City Council
Councillor Lewis Nelson	Salford City Council
Councillor Marie Brabiner	Salford Council
Councillor Helen Hibbert	Stockport Council
Councillor Jill Axford	Trafford Council
Councillor Shaun Ennis	Trafford Council
Councillor Nathan Evans	Trafford Council
Councillor Dane Anderton	Wigan Council
Councillor Debra Wailes	Wigan Council

**OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Eamonn Boylan	GMCA
Gwynne Williams	GMCA
Nicola Ward	GMCA
Adrian Bates	GMCA
Laura Blakey	GMCA
Elaine Mottershead	GMCA
Ninoshka Martins	GMCA

## **O&SC 13/23            APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE**

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors Basil Curley, Colin McLaren, Jenny Harrison, Naila Sharif, Joanne Marshall, and Fred Walker.

## **O&SC 14/23            CHAIRS ANNOUNCEMENTS AND URGENT BUSINESS**

### **1.    GM Cycle Hire Scheme**

Eamonn Boylan, Chief Executive Officer GMCA & TfGM, provided a verbal update on the GM cycle hire scheme. The level of theft and vandalism to the bikes had been such that the required repair rate could not be sustained. A recovery plan had now been put in place and was summarised as follows:

- The recovery plan and maintaining subsequent operation of the scheme would be managed within the original budget that was set in 2021.
- The company operating the scheme had made improvements with additional resources to increase the capacity of their repair and maintenance workshop, alongside improvements to security and technology.
- The Greater Manchester scheme was out-performing its business plan as well as similar arrangements in London (the publicly owned scheme, not the private schemes) and West Midlands.
- Manchester, Salford and Trafford had areas where the scheme had been temporarily suspended but there were no current plans to permanently remove the scheme from any areas. The temporary suspensions would be reviewed in September 2023 by all partners including Greater Manchester Police.
- At the lowest level, there were 200 bikes in operation. There were now 320 in operation with a target of 500 to be available by the end of August 2023.
- In response to a member's question around the sustainability of the scheme and the temporary suspensions, it was confirmed that a significant surplus was retained to ensure that there were replacements readily available.
- In response to a member's request, it was agreed that a full written report (including financial data and the recovery plan) would be brought to the next meeting on 27 September 2023.

2. Urgent Item – Call-in of Chief Executive decision regarding investment to LoveRaw Ltd

Following the requisite number of call-in requests received, the Chair had agreed to consider the report relating to GMCA Investment: LoveRaw Ltd as an item of urgent business for this meeting (Part B).

**RESOLVED /-**

1. That a progress report on Greater Manchester's Cycle Hire scheme be brought to the next meeting.
2. That the Committee consider the report relating to GMCA Investment: LoveRaw Ltd as an item of urgent business for this meeting (Part B).

**O&SC 15/23            DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

No declarations were received in relation to any item on the agenda.

**O&SC 16/23            MINUTES OF THE MEETING HELD ON 26 JULY 2023**

**RESOLVED /-**

That the minutes of the meeting held on 26 July 2023 be approved as a correct record.

**O&SC 17/23            GREATER MANCHESTER RACE EQUALITY STRATEGY**

Councillor Arooj Shah, Portfolio Lead for Equalities and Communities, introduced the report which provided an overview of the developing Greater Manchester Race Equality Strategy. Councillor Shah acknowledged that tackling race inequalities required a long-term commitment and thanked colleagues in Greater Manchester for their continued support and leadership specifically from Elizabeth Cameron, Chair of the Equality Board and GM Mayor Andy Burnham.

During the pandemic, structural racism and related inequalities came to the forefront and were quickly identified as priorities for the region. Councillor Shah drew members' attention to some of the statistics in the report around employment, children & young people, health and housing which further highlighted the need for priority work on this strategy. Five key areas had been identified around leadership, accountability and community engagement, commitment and resources, and performance measures to ensure the required steps could be implemented effectively.

The Chair invited members to consider their potential role in this work and the following questions and comments were noted:

- The Committee agreed that the suggested themes suggested for the Race Equality Strategy felt right.
- In order to support the ambitions, members of the Committee agreed that there was a strong need for political leadership from all place leaders and that a hands on approach to challenging systemic issues was called for.
- There was a view from some members that the report could have contained more detail and specific outcomes. Councillor Shah responded that, as Portfolio Lead, she had been requested to bring this strategy at a very early point to ensure involvement at the developmental stage and that this engagement with Overview & Scrutiny would help shape the priority outcomes for the Strategy.
- There was a challenge around the detail contained in paragraph 1.4 of the report and what work had been done since the Race Equality Panel's establishment in 2020. Councillor Shah responded that progress was at a pace that was disproportionate to the dedication and support of colleagues, some of whom worked in a voluntary capacity, however it was reflective of the significance of the task and the time needed to bring about effective change.

There was acknowledgement that not all statistics could be improved e.g. where health statistics had a genetic basis but, in those situations, members should look to seek improvements on processes or outcomes instead. Similarly, there was discussion about the lack of potential impact in certain areas where there might not be tangible consequences e.g. if a company was not adhering to Greater Manchester's Living Wage initiative.

- It was suggested that, whilst this work needs to be integrated into all other areas, it may benefit from a scrutiny Task and Finish approach. This could for example, include the links between race equality and the criminal justice and education systems.

- The level of scope for this work was discussed and a suggestion made to prioritise quick wins in order to increase the visibility of stepped change and provide focus for the programme.
- In agreeing the initial steps, clarity would be provided over the resources required to deliver on the agreed actions, one of which could be to consider a level of remuneration for Panel members. It was agreed that clear links and a stronger working relationship should be formed between the Overview and Scrutiny Committee and the Race Equality Panel but with a clear aim of co-production and not as a token checkpoint.
- In response to a member's query, Councillor Shah confirmed that the voluntary and social enterprise sector were involved through the members of the panel that already work in that sector and had been consulted already on the Strategy and would continue to be engaged.
- There was a practical suggestion around sourcing work and reports that had been done previously as a baseline. The strategy should, make reference to previous strategies with some explanation as to why they did not produce the desired outcomes, however, reflect that some new approaches would now be necessary.
- Members commented that the GM trailblazer deal should be used to embed the principles of the Strategy in service procurement, delivery and future planning.

#### **RESOLVED /-**

1. That the contents of the report be noted.
2. That the comments of the Overview and Scrutiny Committee be considered when further developing the strategy.
3. That the Equality Strategy, with its links to other areas of work, be considered by the GMCA Overview & Scrutiny Committee for a task and finish project.

**O&SC 18/23            WORK PROGRAMME & FORWARD PLAN OF KEY DECISIONS**

The Chair reminded the Committee that they would be undertaking a workshop to plan the future work programme.

**RESOLVED /-**

That the Overview & Scrutiny work programme be noted.

**O&SC 19/23            FUTURE MEETING DATES**

The Chair drew members' attention to the list of future meeting dates and that the meeting on 27 September will be held at the different time of 2-4pm.

**RESOLVED /-**

That the schedule for future meetings be noted:

27 September 2023	2-4pm
25 October 2023	1-3pm
22 November 2023	1-3pm
13 December 2023	1-3pm
24 January 2024	1-3pm
7 February 2024	1-3pm
21 February 2024	1-3pm
20 March 2024	1-3pm

**O&SC 20/23            EXCLUSION OF THE PRESS AND PUBLIC**

That, under section 100 (A)(4) of the Local Government Act 1972 the press and public should be excluded from the meeting for the following items on business on the grounds that this involved the likely disclosure of exempt information, as set out in the relevant paragraphs of Part 1, Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972 and that the public interest in maintaining the exemption outweighed the public interest in disclosing the information.

**RESOLVED /-**

1. That the contents of the report be noted.
2. That the Committee make no recommendations in relation to the GMCA Investment: LoveRaw Ltd, noting that the decision will stand and may be implemented with immediate effect.
3. That the report on GM Investment Funds, submitted to the GMCA at its meeting on 28 July 2023, be circulated to Committee members.
4. That GM Investment Funds be included on the Overview & Scrutiny Committee future work programme.